

2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> centuries (Early Antiquity) – Bishops and martyrs; Trinitarian controversy; establish Nicene orthodoxy

4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> centuries (Late Antiquity) – Constantine & imperial support; merge of religious/legal systems; councils and *via universalis*; invasion of Northern Europeans (Arian Christians) in 5<sup>th</sup> century

6<sup>th</sup>, 7<sup>th</sup>, 8<sup>th</sup>, 9<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup> centuries (Medieval Period) – localization and technological/agricultural advancement; development of logic and inquiry; monasticism's heyday

11<sup>th</sup>, 12<sup>th</sup>, 13<sup>th</sup> centuries (Late Medieval Period) – Emerging intellectual interest in natural world (closer connection to land in agrarian society)

14<sup>th</sup> century (Late Medieval/Early Renaissance) – Mysticism and Scholasticism; Apocalyptic artwork;

1) How have Christians, in various times and places, understood the human body and/or (more broadly) the material creation?

- Early Christianity/Jewish influence v Hellenistic Influence
  - Paul's discussion of Body of Christ paralleled with human body
    - Means for unification
  - Platonic influence, material world v the Forms – strong dualism
    - Material stuff is ultimately lesser and impure
    - Soul enters body and struggles to remain pure amidst impurity
      - Clement – Miles, 35-36
      - Origen – Miles, 42
    - Clement – Invisible v Visible Church (Miles 52-53)
- Martyrdom (sacrifice of body) as means for spiritual ascendance
  - Origen – Miles, 39-
    - Self castration – Miles, 39
    - Polycarp – earliest Christian martyr (see primary text)
- Celibacy & Monasticism – gender equalizer
  - “spiritual marriages” between men and women w/ celibacy vows in 1<sup>st</sup> century (Miles, 55)
    - Outlawed by churches by 2<sup>nd</sup> century – like gay marriage today – because of strain on definitions of marriage within community
    - Continued; outlawed again in 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> centuries – trying to carve out niche for cooperation between men and women – less hierarchy
  - Only celibate women could hold authority in church (Miles, 56);
- Later periods
  - Origen – Diversity as a mark of fallenness – Miles, 41-42
    - Free will necessitates continual regeneration – Miles, 42
- 4<sup>th</sup> century – theology becomes more transcendent – Christological controversy
  - state church building – liturgical immanence
    - state support – better buildings, better art, better music – many leave for ascetic life, feeling church has become too showy (Miles, 74)
    - Catechesis and Baptism – height of sensory experience – daily exorcism, 40-hour fasting, nakedness, clothed in white robe after baptism, fed milk and honey, all in ornate churches/baptisteries
      - At the same time, naked women baptized by men implies subordination of women in church and possibility of sexual abuse associated with baptism
      - Children baptized first, men second, women last – with loosened hair (symbolize “virginity” at time of baptism or mourning sin before baptism)
      - Eucharist followed baptism – secondary to baptism
      - Post-Nicea, Christianity is referred to as *via universalis* (universal/only way), latter translation abounds for the sake of unifying Empire – reflected in art and architecture (Miles, 93)

- Individual Asceticism – solitude, aphoristic advice (proverbs), self-examination, celibacy
  - Celibacy is only non-negotiable characteristic on ascetic life
  - Cautioned against bodily abuse – probably not uncommon
- Individual asceticism gives way to communal asceticism (monasticism) by end of 4<sup>th</sup> century (compare *Life of Antony* and *Life of Macrina*) (Miles, 88)
  - Institution of monastic rules in an effort to be counter-cultural (Miles, 88)
  - Pull between individual and institutional → setting up for medieval monasticism
- Augustine's influence (356-430ce)
  - Concupiscence (Miles, 95-96) – grasping after the wrong things to satisfy ourselves (typified by infants grasping after everything, but satisfied by nothing)
  - The more we grasp after good things wrongly, the more dissatisfied humans become
  - Requires a conversion of the will
  - “human race exists in a state of punishment.” (Miles, 97)
    - objected to idea of body as a prison
    - the soul grasps wrongly---Aristotelian
  - Creation, Incarnation, Resurrection all indicate body's goodness (Miles, 97)
    - Still, sex binds many people, he renounced sexuality
  - Doctrine of Original Sin
    - Subordination of body to soul, soul to God
    - Human inequality is not ideal, but inevitability of human sin
    - Now, subordination of some to others is necessary to order creation
      - Those in power must aim to serve
  - Dominant voice in *via universalis* through Protestant reformation
- Augustine's opponents
  - Donatists – claimed to be pure from anyone who had deserted during Diocletian persecution
    - Greatly outnumbered Catholics in N Africa during Augustine's life
    - No theological differences with Catholics – schismatics – wanted to create “pure” church
    - Augustine saw church as hospital for sinners – sheep and goats will be separated on judgment day (Miles, 99)
    - Questions over whether or not sacraments were meaningfully administered by Bishops ordained by traitors (Miles, 99) – persisted until Muslim invasions of 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> centuries
  - Manicheans – strongly dualistic – two kingdoms (light and dark)
    - Two-tiered order – “perfecti” (ascetics) were celibate and vegan; “hearers” provided for the perfecti (Augustine was one for 9 years)
    - Humans are responsible for all living beings – all life feels
      - Augustine – humans are only responsible for rational minds
    - Fled persecution by Catholic Christians, and established Christianity in China by 7<sup>th</sup> or 8<sup>th</sup> century
  - Pelagians – emphasis on Christian will/piety
    - “Since perfection is possible, perfection is obligatory.” (Miles, 101)
    - sin is the result of socialization into sinful culture (Miles, 101)
    - grace given at birth and moral effort are enough to act rightly (Miles, 101)
- Christological controversies resulted in highly incarnational liturgies and popular religion (Miles, 116)
  - Increasing division of Eastern and Western religion from 5<sup>th</sup> century → leading to the Great Schism in the 11<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 116) – peaceful existence based on separation
- Iconoclastic controversy – see differences between Western and Eastern approach to theological knowledge
  - Icons are intentionally distorted – apophatic depiction – emphasis on what is happening spiritually
    - Emphasis on soul's domination of body
    - Iconostasis – wooden screen on which *theotokos* and icons are depicted
  - Largely an Eastern Controversy
  - Iconoclasts (Emperor Constantine V) outlawed icons that were not “identical in essence” to that which it portrays – only Eucharist is identical to Christ, thousands of iconophile monks killed (Miles, 121)

- Iconophiles (John of Damascus) argued the Incarnation as justification for icons
  - Resolved first wave of conflict at Second Council of Nicea (787ce)
    - Designated three levels of veneration – saints/angels, then divine figures, then God alone
- Levels of veneration created questions about how much to venerate icons—gave rise to second wave of persecution—“you’re venerating the icon too much/not enough” (Miles, 122)
  - 2<sup>nd</sup> wave ended with second Council (843ce) that re-affirmed use of icons (the people liked them)
- By the 9<sup>th</sup> century, strong marriage regulations were in place that resisted marriage by coercion
  - People generally married in their late-20s
  - Not allowed to enter the church for 30 days after marriage—sex is tainted, but reproduction makes it acceptable (Miles, 131)
  - After plague in 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> centuries, marriage became more important—many weddings conducted while the couple was in bed—obvious connection (Miles, 131)
  - Legislated abstinence over 100 days a year---mixed feelings about sex
- 12<sup>th</sup> century brought heightened interest in miracles—God’s direct activity in the world (Miles, 147)
  - relics abound (Miles, 147)
  - people are traveling because of the Crusades, so healers and relics gives them reasons to stop (tourism) (Miles, 148)
- Hildegard (1098-1179ce) – saw visions of color and light without impeding her normal vision (Miles, 150)
  - Wrote music for monastic liturgies
  - Understood theology in light of the arts—music reminds humans of time before the Fall when everything was harmonious
- Heightened interest in miracles and relics led to great numbers of Pilgrims—especially to Rome, Jerusalem and Cathedral of St James in North Spain
  - St Helena, Constantine’s Mother sparked interest in pilgrimage by going to Jerusalem and claiming to find a piece of Christ’s cross (like gold miners in America)
  - Pilgrimages were sometimes ordered as punishment for a crime (Miles, 156)
  - Became first forms of vacation/holiday—requires privilege (Miles, 157)
    - Strongly rooted in Incarnation—if Go became flesh, then God sympathizes with humans and will heal us (Miles, 157)
  - Many monasteries opened hospitals along pilgrimage routes to care for sick pilgrims—became more about safe lodging (hotels) (Miles, 157)
  - Pilgrimage led to tourism, which led to stronger associations of people into towns and cities with flourishing economies (Miles, 158)
- Bonaventure and Franciscans
  - 6 stages of ascent
    - natural world is first rung in the ladder—close relationship between knowing and feeling
    - the mind’s eye is Created to discern the connectedness of the universe—realize this through the senses
      - attention to physical world produces delight and delight fuels the ascent to God
    - Next, God is understood as Creator of connected universe
    - Next, realize God’s image in creation, including self
  - Beginning of empirical scientific inquiry (Miles, 166)
  - Hierarchical - God → angels → souls → bodies
    - Only room for positive spirit and matter; evil is no-thing (the opposite of God)
- Aquinas
  - Unlike Augustine, sex is not the transmitter of original sin
  - Corrupted sexuality like all other sin is a result of original sin (Miles, 172)
  - When he died, his body was boiled and bones, teeth, etc divided as relics
    - 25 years later, Pope Boniface VIII prohibited the practice (possibly in relation to the inextricability of the soul from the body) (Miles, 174)
- Gothic Cathedrals of 13<sup>th</sup> century
  - Built to host touring pilgrims

- Emphasis on beauty as trigger of mystical experience (Miles 176)
- Two characteristics: heavy building materials and a lot of light (Miles, 179)
  - Symbolic of need to balance heavy (material) with light (spiritual)
- Bernard of Clairvaux argued against ornate decoration and building as vanity (like iconoclast controversy) (Miles 176)
- Abbott Suger of St. Denis Cathedral argued in favor of ornateness – God’s immaterial beauty is revealed through material – like Christ’s immaterial presence in the material sacramental elements
- Ritual becomes more important as people are moving less and settling in urban areas (Miles, 177)
  - Artwork, liturgies all meant to communicate and teach
  - Durandus of Mende developed a theology of stained glass (Miles, 179)
- Plague broke out in 1340s and occurred every generation until 17<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 187)
  - Plague caused severe paranoia and ensued with dramatic displays of violence – public executions
  - Corpses with plague were used as ammunition of fired/deposited in enemy camps to spread disease – as soldiers fled the camp, they carried plague with them all over Europe (Miles, 187)
  - Public execution serves as a way to domesticate/control and dramatize death that is all around in culture
  - Images of bodies decomposing with inscriptions about the brevity of life (Miles, 188)
- Late Medieval Mysticism – largely lay movement with writings in vernacular (popularizing religion) (Miles, 188); individuality that develops out of largely independent/mobile pilgrims
  - Emphasis on individual experience (Miles, 189); required no training or affiliation in order to have mystical experience
  - English Mystics
    - Richard Rolle (d. 1349) (English hermit) v. Margery Kempe (d. 1433) (traveling “public weeper”) (Miles, 190)
    - Julian of Norwich (d. after 1413)
      - Furthered uses of pain for religious use/development
      - Recovered from illness and glorified illness as vehicle for mystical experience (theologizing plague)
      - Likened God-human relationship to that of a mother and child
      - Likened Incarnation to Mother’s birth of a child
        - Presented much more intimate picture of God than gothic cathedrals (transcendence → immanence)
  - German Mystics
    - Meister Eckhart (d. 1328) – 14<sup>th</sup> century Dominican
      - Accused of equating unity with God through mystical experience with identity with God. (Miles, 194)

2) How do contexts of persecution, suffering, and violence inform Christian theology and practice in the ancient and medieval periods?

- Martyrdom is participation in Christ’s suffering (Miles, 67)
- Persecution ends in 261ce and begins again in 303ce because some Christians are accused of disturbing an Oracle’s ability to foretell the outcome of a battle (Miles, 67)
  - 3K dead in the East, 3K dead in the West
  - Avoid persecution easily by demonstrating loyalty to State-sacrifice grain to Emperor – still many did not comply
- Martyrdom is viewed as a way a battle between spiritual forces – the martyr is participating in a cosmic battle between God and Satan (Miles, 67)
  - Christians “conquered” the evil empire through martyrdom – converted it
- Constantine was converted after a vision of a cross imposed on the sun, which was put on the shields of soldiers – Romans won the battle and Constantine was convinced
  - Outlawed gladiatorial contests (Miles, 70)
  - Outlawed branding slaves’ faces – image of God (Miles, 70)

- Designated “the Sun’s day” as a holiday – Sunday
- Legislated household codes – elopement, divorce, adultery
- Athanasius uses martyrs’ deaths as evidence that Christ has overcome death—the ultimate of sin’s effects—non-existence as being utterly opposed God’s image in us
  - Unity with Christ transcends human finitude and activates divinity within (Miles, 91)
- In flux of Northern Europeans and Arabs from the South made classical learning a very low priority
  - People needed to be able to defend themselves with might, not thought (Miles, 127)
    - Boethius bemoaned loss of classical learning, and wrote extensively about arithmetic, geometry, astronomy and theology (480-524ce) (Miles, 127)
    - Imprisoned and executed for plots against the emperor—disrupting the unity of empire during attack; consoled himself with dreams of a just and rational universe (first buds of enlightenment)
    - Thoroughly uninterested in religious explanations of the universe
- Crusades begin in 1095 to reclaim Holy Lands from invading Moslems
  - Crusaders made no distinction between Jews and Muslims as they crusaded (Miles, 180)
    - Jews were forcibly baptized and/or killed across Europe
      - Jews were blamed for death of Christ (Miles, 181)
- Julian of Norwich
  - Theologized plague by furthering idea that suffering is useful in mystical experience

3) What major contributions to the shape of Christian theology (doctrines of God, Christ, Mary) resulted from the Council of Nicea (325) and the Council of Chalcedon (451)? Consider not only what was included but also what was excluded. Were such definitions and exclusions, in your view, necessary, and why or why not? What are the advantages or disadvantages of a polemical context or framing of theological practice? **Closely connected with first question – especially in medieval period**

- Trinitarian and Christological Controversies
  - 3 Problems – Miles, 44
    - God suffered
    - Formulation of dogma (teaching)
    - Contextual differences
  - Platonic conceptions of Monad and emanations results in Christ less than God – Miles, 44
  - Differences between Greek East and Latin West of Empire
    - Economic trinity – Hippolytus and Tertullian – Western (emphasize unity)
      - God is one, but appears in different manifestations/persons/roles at different times, Tertullian (Miles, 45)
        - “root, tree and fruit” (Miles, 45); “Sun and rays” - hierarchical
        - avoids God (the One) suffering – it was a “ray” that suffered, not the Sun
        - like one person wearing multiple masks (Miles, 46)
    - Subordinationist trinity – Origen & Dionysius – Eastern (emphasize distinction)
      - Three Distinct aspects – Son is uncreated and created
        - Pray to God *through* Christ
      - Dionysius separated God into three separate entities – Father, Son, HS
    - Monarchian trinity – modalistic or adoptionist
      - Jesus was an adopted human being – made divine
- Constantine inherited widespread conflict over persons who lapsed during persecution, Trinitarian controversies and developing Christological controversies—couldn’t be settled by Edict of Toleration
  - Arian controversy – Christ is pre-existent with the Father (Alexander) v Christ was begotten or created, before which he did not exist (Arius) (Miles, 70)
    - Represented movement away from Platonism – Arius is still using Plato’s hierarchical cosmic structure
- Constantine calls Council of Nicea in 325ce
  - Attends and participates, but does not decide—considers whole thing trifling
  - Ecumenical council—representative of and binding for all Christians

- Only 6 of 318 Bishops from the West – many of whom had been tortured during Diocletian persecution (Miles, 71)
  - Fairly moderate statement (with anti-Arian sentiment) to accommodate majority who were between Arius and Alexander – Arius refused to sign and was exiled (Miles, 71-72)
    - Begotten, not made
    - Of one essence with the Father
    - Personal and abstract imagery
    - Reference to earliest baptismal creed from Philipians 2
  - Pronounces “anathema” on dissenters – cursed to hell (Miles, 72)
- Controversy continues after Constantine’s death
  - Arius’ creaturely Christ cannot save (Miles, 72) – needs to have full divine power
    - Ultimately a pastoral and soteriological concern, as well as eschatological
    - Arius – Christ’s example of spiritual growth through suffering saves (Miles, 73)
      - Because Arius’ views were widely popular, he was reinstated to communion and anathema many times
  - Athanasius – aid to Alexander at Nicea; became Bishop of Alexandria after Alexander
    - Outspoken advocate of full divinity of Christ (Miles, 89)
    - Highly volatile and intolerant – defied Edict of Tolerance (Miles, 90)
  - Arius emphasized Christ’s closeness to human experience, while Athanasius focused on Christ’s transcendence of human experience (Miles, 92)
- Sack of Rome by Visigoths in 410ce – no more security to argue over doctrinal issues – bigger fish to fry
  - Eastern Empire is still secure, so doctrinal controversies rage – Eastern Empire had twice as much money, so they could pay opponents to leave and go West
- Council of Constantinople (381ce) – called by Theodosius I to end Arian controversy
  - Much smaller crowd (half), no Westerners attended
  - settled Trinitarian conflict, but Christological controversy raged on
    - Augustine articulated popular understanding of trinity as memory, understanding and will in *On the Trinity*
  - Nicene Creed is ratified to end controversy – doesn’t work
    - Added section about work of HS
    - Two views about Christ dominated – Antiochean v Alexandrian (Miles, 107)
      - Theodore of Mopsuestia, Antiochean – strong distinction between divine and human nature – divine nature did not suffer – emphasized humanity
      - Cyril, Alexandrian Bishop – “hypostatic union;” Body of Christ is a tool of Divinity – violent personality
      - Apollinaris – Jesus possessed perfect divinity, but not integral humanity (Miles, 108)
- Council of Ephesus (431ce) – Convened by Cyril of Alexandria
  - Nestorius (of Constantinople) was present but wouldn’t participate – anathematized
  - Syrian Bishops arrived late and held separate Council with Nestorius – anathematized Cyril
  - Western delegates of Pope arrived finally and ruled in favor of Cyril’s council
  - Main issue was *theotokos* – Does God have a mother?
    - Cyril supported *theotokos* – unity of natures – true of Jesus, true of God
    - Nestorius supported *christotokos* – God does not have a mother; *distinction* of natures
      - Larger issue over God’s vulnerability – does God need to be fed? Does God need hiding in Egypt? Etc.
      - What kind of God can save? Soteriological
      - Larger implications for status of women in institutionalized church
        - Eastern women celebrated the council’s decision
    - Attempted to publish creed that compromised both sides – stronger Western influence (*theotokos*) with some Eastern concessions
- Council of Chalcedon (451ce) – convened by Marcian, a soldier emperor – wanted unity, not concerned about theology – change from philosopher emperors
  - Drew up another draft of Nicene Creed, canonized (2) letters on Christology by Cyril
    - Declared Constantinople equal to Rome in Papal authority (Miles, 116)

- Eastern theologians concerned about the idea that everything true of Christ's humanity is true of divinity—might lead people to aim for deification (Miles, 111)
- Accepted Western emphasis on two distinct natures, typified by Pope Leo I
- Responses to Chalcedon:
  - Monophysitism (Coptics, Jacobites, Armenians) – Christ's divine nature subsumed his human nature (Miles, 112)
    - Eastern emphasis on asceticism at work---soul dominates body (Miles, 112)
    - God's power acted directly in Jesus the human—no sin or suffering
    - Divided empire – much greater number of Monophysites than Chalcedonians
  - Mostly non-Chalcedonian in Syria, Palestine, Central and Southeast Asia (Miles, 113)
    - Major movement of Non-Chalcedonians
      - Nestorians moved from Syria to Mesopotamia and Persia
      - Monophysites moved to Syria and Persia
- All three groups—Orthodox/Chalcedonian, Nestorian and Monophysite—all accepted Nicene Creed and believed they had the correct interpretation
- Council of Toledo (589ce) – added *filioque* to Creed – HS proceeds from Father *and* Son (Western emphasis on unity/equality of Trinity); East wanted hierarchical—HS proceeds from Father *through* the Son (Miles, 116-117)
- Christ's true perfection meant that God intervenes in the human/physical world—leads to miracles and relics (Miles, 168)
- Devotion to Mary exploded at start of 13<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 174)
  - Gothic cathedrals developed out of France and spread internationally
  - Large Pilgrimage churches funded by tourism

4) How did ancient and medieval Christian thought frame the relationship of Christianity to “others” (e.g., Jews, pagans, heretics, Muslims, etc....)? What resources and what problems are generated, in relation to the challenge of addressing “difference” in our own context?

- Origen – Diversity as a mark of fallenness – Miles, 41-42
- Martyrdom as opportunity for women to transcend/bend gender and achieve authority (Perpetua and Felicity)
- Emphasis on unity, especially under Constantine
  - In 2<sup>nd</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> centuries, more local authorities w/ Bishops and local martyrs
  - Council of Nicea
  - Anathema of Arius and followers
- Northern pressure from heretic Arians begins in 3<sup>rd</sup> century and becomes significant in the 4<sup>th</sup>
- Constantine named Emperor in 305; institutes religious freedom in 313 (Edict of Toleration); Christianity named State religion in 380s
  - State money is used to build churches, copy scriptures
  - Eusebius, “church buildings make Christ's incarnation visible to all.” (Miles, 68)
- Emperor Theodosius establishes Christianity as State religion in 380ce (not Constantine) (Miles, 102)
  - Constantine made Christianity a *legitimate* religion of the Empire.
- Where Christians were once the persecuted “others,” with state support, they went to great lengths to establish themselves with buildings, ecumenical creeds and anathema (Miles, 74)
  - All this was further evidence of triumphal spirit of 4<sup>th</sup> century Christianity—martyrs had conquered evil Empire and converted it
  - Catechesis established to differentiate between social converts and real Christians (Miles, 77)
- As Christianity is structured, women lose roles and authority
  - Controversy about women's voices being too seductive to be heard in church at all
  - Naked women baptized by men in Catechesis
- Asceticism opened up possibilities for women—less institutional (Miles, 84)
  - Celibacy as an alternative for women who chose not to marry (see *Life of Macrina*)
    - Disrupted inheritance structure—if only daughter takes vow of celibacy, family inheritance passes to state
    - Asceticism provided social support/protection for widows (...*Macrina*)

- Allowed women to travel safely and without male permission—visit holy sites (Miles, 85)
  - Did asceticism require/imply privilege? Who paid for and provided ascetics with food, shelter, money to travel?
- Athanasius and Christological controversy
  - Arians are tolerant and eager to fulfill Constantine's desire to unite the empire
  - Athanasius was highly intolerant and volatile to unorthodox Arians
- 380ce – Theodosius makes Christianity official State religion
  - use of term “pagan” emerges to refer to all Roman religions other than Christianity (including Judaism)
  - *via universalis*
  - Sacred State – all laws are divinely given
    - Clergy exempted from taxes and trials
    - Christians now have the power—quickly become coercive
    - Augustine—the State secures the church so the church can bring God's Kingdom to earth
      - State supports the church; church supports the State
- *Via universalis* and councils of 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> centuries effectively marginalized Jews from public life (Miles, 112)
  - Couldn't hold public office
  - Synagogues were destroyed
  - Supersessionist theology abounds—in mosaics, artwork, sermons
- Huge persecution of non-Chalcedonian Christians in Empire—Theodosius and Zoroastrian rule
  - 153,000 people by mid-5<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 113)
- Presence of non-Chalcedonian Christians (barbarians—non-Greek speaking) halts persecution in late 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> centuries
  - Visigoths—Christianized by Arian Christians fleeing persecution before
- “Barbarian” invasions of Western Empire, especially Italy, changed the map of Europe in 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 123)
  - made Ravenna imperial city, over Rome (404ce) (Miles, 123)
- Islam was born in the 7<sup>th</sup> century and established a permanent opposing force to Christianity through Europe, Asia and N Africa (Miles, 123)
  - By early 8<sup>th</sup> century, all N Africa, Spain and S France were Arab ruled (Miles, 123)
  - Islam was originally viewed as Christian heresy, but distinguished itself by 8<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 124)
  - Significant exchange of ideas and services between Arabs and non-Chalcedonian Christians between 750-950ce (Miles, 124)
- Jews in the 6<sup>th</sup> century
  - Barbarian leaders felt no responsibility to recognize or protect Jews' legal status (Miles, 126)
    - Forcefully baptized at times
    - Reported by Bishop Gregory of Tours (Frankish province-Gaul) as parasitic, ignorant and expendable (Miles, 127)
  - Earliest legislation against Jews (330ce) prohibited Jewish proselytizing and Jews owning Christian slaves or holding public office (Miles, 126)
    - Also required taxes be diverted from Jerusalem to Rome
  - Drew off strong supersessionism from 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> centuries
- In 1095, Pope Urban II called for a “pilgrimage” to liberate Christ's tomb and to free Christians from Islamic rule in Jerusalem (Miles, 140)
  - Large mob of untrained soldiers (regular people) who pillaged and spread plague across much of Europe—killed many Jews along the way (Miles, 140)
- In 1096ce, Crusaders captured Constantinople and took Jerusalem in 1099ce (Miles, 140)
  - Crusades continued for 3 centuries
- Re-centralization in 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> century meant new need to define the “other”
  - Pope Innocent III (1179) ordered all diseased, madmen and possessed by the Devil be shut up in leper communes (Miles, 180)

- Pope Innocent made agenda of Fourth Lateran Council (1215) to eliminate heresy, reinforce faith, reform morals, uproot vice and ward off excess. (Miles, 180)
  - Also decreed that Jews be branded with a visible badge as outsiders in a Christian Society, also pay extra tax and can't hold office
  - Re-declared *via universalis*
- Thomas Aquinas' work gave "logical" rationale for Christianity's universal coherence and recognizability, which was used against Jews
  - Could no longer claim "ignorance" about Christ's identity
- Cathars also existed in Southern France – dissident group that claimed complete separateness of body and soul (Miles, 181)
  - Body and soul are at war
  - Practiced ascetical disciplines of diet and celibacy
    - Vigilant campaign killed them all and burned their books (Miles, 182)
  - Denied Incarnation – inconceivable for God to be reduced to material
  - Fourth Lateran Council defined trans-substantiation specifically to rebut Cathars claim that sacrament was both physical and spiritual. (Miles, 182)
- Cathedrals were strong symbols of dominant views – Saints, Incarnation, Mary, mother of Incarnation Christ
  - Imposing buildings with extensive artwork and liturgy for mostly non-literate society

5) Where have Christians historically located authority? Discuss in terms of both change and continuity over time (and place).

- **Antiquity – 2<sup>nd</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> centuries**
  - **Scripture**
    - Origen, typology, allegory – Miles, 40-41
      - Limitations of speculation – Miles, 41
  - **Culture & Context**
    - Counter-culture instincts, but cultural influence
      - Exclusively male leadership by 3<sup>rd</sup> century
      - Resistance to culturally prevalent determinism for free will, responsibility
  - **Order v Unpredictability – beginning of church structure**
    - **Prophecy – Spirit regards authority of Bishops and maintains order – Ignatius of Antioch (Miles, 49)**
      - "Montanist groups argued for the volatile and unpredictable leadership of the HS." (Miles, 49)
      - Tertullian was a Montanist – See Intro to Acts of Perpetua & Felicity
      - God continues to reveal v Apostolic succession (God revealed, we pass)
    - **Authority**
      - **Bishops – every small town had a Bishop, established during 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> centuries (Miles, 50); created rivalries and conflict**
        - Men, +50 years, married (not remarried), Christian children, meek, merciful, peaceful, learned, know the scriptures – lifelong appointment
        - Raise money from donors – discern who to accept money from
        - Legal disputes settled by Bishops – resist secular courts
        - Responsible for whole congregation at Day of Judgment – inclusion or exclusion from community if you gave Bishop a better/worse shot at being approved by God
      - **Checks on Bishop Authority**
        - Elected by clergy with consent of congregation (Miles, 51)
        - High-risk position – Bishops targeted for persecution before widespread Christian persecution
      - **Conflict between attempted-martyr's and Bishops' authority**

- People who survived martyrdom became legendary, while many Bishops were in hiding to avoid martyrdom – conflict between ordered authority and people’s choice
- Heresy & Schism
  - “holding false opinions about God” (Miles, 52) – false according to Bishops
  - Schism – those with different ideas about church order, regardless of belief
    - Schismatics withdrew and organized separate communities (Miles, 52)
      - Schismatics often referred to as heretics
  - “Heretics” were too focused on a *part* of Christian faith/life (Miles, 52)
    - Montanists – continuing prophesy, and “new discipline” for Christian life; apocalyptic fervor – living in “last times;” resisted church that was more interested in unity than in moral rigor and prophetic utterance (Miles, 52)
      - Fasting
      - No repentance after Baptism (Augustine)
      - No remarriage
      - No hiding from martyrdom/persecution
- Women’s Roles
  - More authority in heterodox communities – became a way to identify heretical communities
  - Feminine imagery more common among heterodox communities, though present among “orthodox” communities
- Christian state creates new concepts of authority and stronger appeal for Christian unity
  - Council of Nicea – create ecumenical creed to define orthodox beliefs
    - Anathema anyone who doesn’t get onboard
    - Also declared 20 canons regarding church polity and order – more institutional
      - Standardize liturgical practices
  - Now, politically advantageous to become Christian – state support and money
    - Difficult to tell who *really* believes – strengthening of institutional structures, as well as merge with political structures
    - Create stringent catechetical rites – concluding with recitation of orthodox Creed
- As Christianity becomes institutionalized, many drop out of society to practice asceticism in Egyptian deserts (Miles, 84)
  - Ascetics largely admired and revered – development out of martyr tradition
    - Self-denial w/ cosmic outlook developing in triumphalism of 4<sup>th</sup> century church – ascetics represented God in cosmic battle against Satan (see *Life of Antony*)
- Pope Leo I (440-461ce) is first to assert papal primacy – claimed to be Peter’s successor (apostolic succession)
- Pope Gelasius I (492-6) asserted that papal authority superseded imperial authority
  - Struggle between Emperor and Pope persisted into middle ages
- Councils of 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> century – agreement over Nicene Creed, but difference in interpretation
- Only 3 recognized theologians in East (Miles, 117)
  - Mystics and poets more than theologians
  - Division of Western concepts of knowledge (increasingly analytical) and Eastern (increasingly experiential, liturgical) (Miles, 117) – asceticism/contemplation
    - Cataphatic knowledge – affirmed by scripture and revelation
    - Apophatic – human knowledge is limited and therefore metaphoric, symbolic
    - See John of Damascus – Icons – emphasis on the unknowable qualities of God
    - Innovation and heresy become synonymous (nothing beyond the early fathers)
  - Nicephorus – theology better communicated through images than through language
    - Best grasped as sensory experience, not theoretical concepts (Miles, 118)
  - Human will and Divine grace synergistically interact
- Justinian was Byzantine Emperor (526-47ce) and sought to reestablish Roman Empire’s glory
  - Brief resuscitation of Roman culture
  - Sought to exterminate Arian Christianity imported by “Barbarians”

- Married a Monophysite woman—rumored to have been a child prostitute—made provincial governors swear allegiance to him and his wife, Theodora (innovation) (Miles, 125)
- Patrick planted seed of Christianity in Ireland in 430s, but reports of Irish church do not emerge until 6<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 128)
  - Organized around country monasteries controlled by abbots, rather than Bishops
    - Did not require celibacy of clergy
    - Not united with Roman church until 1172ce (reluctantly)
- Charlemagne is crowned “Holy Roman Emperor” by Pope Leo III (742-814ce) (Miles, 129)
  - Crowned by Pope—implies greater power, but afterward Leo knelt before Charlemagne
  - Ambiguous power structure
- Charlemagne’s reign had 2 goals: reestablish classical learning and exterminate paganism (Miles, 129)—precursor to late Medieval Period
  - Forced baptism for the sake
  - Legalized “Christian” ideals – instituted death penalty for killing clergy, refusing to be Baptized or eating meat during Lent.
  - Instituted several Saints’ Days, since murder on a Saints’ Day was a mortal sin (Miles, 131)
- Feudalism develops in response to widespread chaos (Miles, 134)
  - Weaker landowners out themselves under care of stronger lords
    - Agricultural economy, little economy, very decentralized (few towns and cities)
    - Decentralization means weak Pope and other authorities that require centralized populations
- Emperor Otto III removes Papacy from Roman control—from then on, Popes chosen from around the world (Miles, 134)
- Pope Leo IX begins significant Gregorian (after Pope Gregory VII) church reform with Council of Rheims (1049) and with First Lateran Council (Miles, 134)
  - Derived “a pattern of life in which the priesthood was set aside from and over the laity”
  - Taught that church unity was based on papal leadership
    - Reformed practice of wealthy laypeople electing and installing priests and bishops
- 9<sup>th</sup> – 12<sup>th</sup> centuries were heyday for monasticism – received papal support (Miles, 135)
  - Benedict’s Rule – main function of monastic life is to support society with prayer and liturgical life
    - Wealthy laypeople/landowners paid monks to support them in life and death through prayer (Miles, 136)
    - Continual acts of prayers, labor and worship throughout the day and night
    - Learning not emphasized
  - Monks collected classic Christian writings and early Patristic commentaries on scripture (Miles, 137)
    - Extensive work with Augustine—lacked sacramental theology and refrained from claims of double predestination (Miles, 137)
    - Arguments raged over relationship between sacraments and righteous acts
      - Gottschalk—grace alone (like Augustine) (d. 862ce)
        - Since monks were among the elect, his attitude was one of gratitude (forgot about the unelect)
      - Hincmar—without free will, there is complacency (d. 882ce)
        - Parish bishop—more in touch with common people—more mindful of those who did not appear to be elect
    - John Scotus Erigena (810-77ce) and Irish school head formulated dialectics based on the work of Dionysius and other classical thinkers
      - Valuable tool for systematic/logical systems of thought (Miles, 139)
        - Condemned until the 12<sup>th</sup> century
        - Connected rational processes to understanding spiritual matters
          - Faith came first, but reason was more important
- In the 11<sup>th</sup> century, church and monasteries underwent significant reform
  - Following, new monasteries sprung up and began associating—forming more centralized forms of governance and association (Miles, 140)

- Anselm – became Archbishop of Canterbury, but started poor in the country
  - Followed in footsteps of John Scotus a century later (Miles, 141)
  - Advocated highly disciplined meditation infused with philosophical inquiry
    - Did not reference scripture or patristic authority – first one (Miles, 141)
    - Reason is natural activity of faith – “faith seeking understanding”
    - Blended traditional monasticism (worship, prayer, labor) with intellectual passion
  - God is known through experience, and understanding is a form of experience (Miles, 142)
    - Could not know God without a relationship with God
      - Alternating prayer and inquiry/analysis
  - Wrote first treatise explaining how salvation happened (1098ce) – *Cur Deus Homo*, “Why God Became Human” (Miles, 143)
    - Characteristic of his feudal society – local governments that functioned according to private contracts (Miles, 144)
      - God (Feudal Lord) promises to protect subjects in exchange for service
      - By sin, humans voluntarily came under Satan’s authority
      - By sin, Humans have infringed on God’s honor
      - God requires restitution
      - Humans have no way to repay God
      - God must repay God’s self with Christ – both human and divine
        - Christ’s death is voluntary, though necessary (Miles, 145)
    - Rejected long-held belief that Satan held “rights” to humanity
      - Only Peter Abelard agreed at the time
    - Equated “beauty” with universal order in light of a very chaotic, arbitrary world
    - Used to justify Crusades – Muslims had infringed on God’s honor, so God was taking it back by force by way of Crusades
      - Strong emphasis on infringement on honor and need for restitution (Miles, 145)
      - Purgatory (1170ce) gave people an opportunity to make restitution after death → indulgences take real shape under this thought later in the Medieval Period
- While relics abound on ground level, Intellectuals are talking about *universitas* – The idea of an ordered universe under God’s providence (chaos of fractured society leaves people looking for order and connection) (Miles, 148)
- First vernacular books published by monks about mystical experience in 14<sup>th</sup> century (Miles, 148)
  - Julian’s *Showings* is included
  - Richard Rolle’s *Fire of Divine Love*
    - Evidence of monastic sexuality
- Once Anselm distinguished prayer and reason as two activities, more interest developed in reason because of longer history with prayer and more immediate/evident results (Miles, 148)
- Richard of St. Victor (d. 1173) wrote about finding inconsistencies in the work of the Patristics – correct them because they’re best honored by solid scholarship (Miles, 149)
- Bernard of Clairvaux claimed that Jesus’ life was redemptive as well as his death and that humans have a carnal love of Jesus because of devotion to the work he did as a human (Miles, 150)
  - Referred to Mary as “Mediatrice” – intermediary between humans and Christ – too awesome and too just to be approached
- Monasteries coming to own huge amounts of land because of wills and inheritance
- First universities developed and furthered the work dialectics (Scotus)
  - Emerged from medieval Bishop’s schools associated with cathedrals (Miles, 152)
  - Private until 13<sup>th</sup> century – students roamed from school to school looking for interesting ideas (Miles, 152)
    - Much like spiritual ascetics’ relationships with spiritual masters
  - *Universitas* was a term that referred to guilds – like other guilds, scholars aimed to defend their craft and teach the next generation to do it
    - Using dialectics, theology was engaged as rational discourse that would mirror the intelligible reality (knowable universe)

- Debate between Platonic and Aristotelian influence—larger categories or individual integrity? (Miles, 152)
- Abelard (d.1142)
  - Questioned Anselm’s legal account of redemption and how God could be satisfied by the death of any innocent person (Miles, 153)
    - Doubting leads to questioning, questioning leads to the truth
- By 1220, two orders of Friars existed: Franciscans (those who modeled the Christian life) and Dominicans (preachers)
  - Dominicans – based on the Rule of St Augustine – became wandering missionaries/preachers
  - New type of monastic/ascetic – committed to poverty and mobility, reflected much more mobile society and connection to the urban poor in new cities (Miles, 159)
- Francis of Assisi typifies new monasticism—the natural world is the world in which God operates, we don’t need to separate ourselves from it, but become more a part of it (Miles, 160)
  - Bonaventure reinterpreted Francis’ Order to own property and be more associated with the universities—less about poverty and humility, more about possession and scholasticism
    - 6 stages of ascent
- Thomas Aquinas (d. 1274) – raised in Benedictine Abbey
  - Became Dominican in 1244 (19yrs old)
  - Taught at University of Paris (intellectual center)
  - Controversial use of Aristotle – condemned after his death, but canonized in 1323
    - Trilingual (Latin, Greek, Arabic) Jewish scholars translated Aristotle and his Muslim commentators into Latin, the first time Aristotle was available in the West
    - Aristotle provided framework for universal inquiry without any reference to God (Miles, 166)
  - Glossing – commented on biblical texts and commentaries as he read them (read a paragraph, comment, read, comment...) (Miles, 166)
    - Easy to confuse what’s text and what’s comment if you’re a student
  - Changed question from *What is more real—spirit or matter?* to *How can humans know reality?* (Miles, 169)
    - Drawing on Aristotle and Bonaventure, said that reason and measurement are the ways to know what is real. (Miles, 169)
    - Know reality through reason; know revelation through faith.
      - Further distinguish God and sensible world
      - Imagination is the foundation of theological knowledge. (Miles, 170)
    - Can know some things about God without revelation—God exists, God’s creativity, god’s providence (Miles, 170)
  - Insisted on human free will—highly practical
  - Body and soul are permanently connected – “the soul is the form of the body”
    - Soul is not only associated with highest functions of body (Miles, 171)
    - Plato – the soul is the person; Thomas – the soul is not the person
    - Defined touch as highest human sense—over and above sight
- Gothic Cathedrals
  - Signaled centralization into towns and cities
  - Pilgrims staying still
  - Church structures become more authoritative (Miles, 180)
  - Development of trade organizations and bourgeois
- Rigid Hierarchical society
  - Death often and vividly depicted in artwork to symbolize ultimate equality of humanity and also accountability before God (reinforce social structures) (Miles, 187)

Part II. Be prepared to discuss any one of the following dates, explaining why it represents a significant turning point in the history of Christianity: what happens on or around this date, and how would you describe differences between the periods of history before and after this date? I choose this one.

- 1) 70 – Fall of Jerusalem Temple
- 312 – Constantine makes Christianity legitimate religion in Roman Empire?
- 476 – Fall of Rome
- 1000 – Turn from Early to Late Medieval Period

**Paradigms:**

- Transcendence → Immanence
- Individuality → Institutionalism
- Fracture/Decentralization → Association/Connection
- Judgment → Mercy/Grace